Negative: Aircraft Repair

By “Coach Vance” Trefethen

The AFF case claims that European countries that use US-built military aircraft in their armed forces are required to send the parts back to the US for maintenance and repair, rather than fixing them in Europe. Plan removes this requirement and allows European countries to fix their aircraft locally instead of sending back to the US.

Negative: Aircraft Repair 3

TOPICALITY 3

1. Nothing reformed 3

Status Quo is already repairing FMS (Foreign Military Sales) aircraft inside Europe. Example: AAR Component Repair in Amsterdam 3

Impact: Resolution not affirmed means NEG ballot 3

INHERENCY 3

1. The F-16 3

Poland had the service contract for the F-16 to be performed at Military Aviation Works No. 2 in Poland 3

F-16 aircraft are maintained in Romania 4

2. The F-35 4

F-35 - Training, ground crews, and logistics are done inside Europe 4

3. Amendola Air Base in Italy 4

F-35 is maintained at Amendola Air base in Italy by European mechanics 4

4. Cameri Air Base in Italy 4

Italy has new maintenance facility for European F-35s at Cameri Air Base in northern Italy 4

Cameri is fully certified by US contractor Lockheed Martin for maintenance, repair, overhaul and upgrade 5

Maintenance services for F-35 are growing at Cameri Air Base in Italy with Italian mechanics 5

5. Netherlands parts warehouse 5

US Defense Dept. (the Pentagon) approved storage of F-35 parts in the Netherlands 5

6. Great Britain has it too 6

Royal Air Force base (RAF) Marham and MOD (Ministry of Defense installation) Sealand in Great Britain are doing complete support for F-35s 6

7. Europe military readiness. F-35 solves 6

F-35 is rolling out across Europe 6

F-35 solves for European security 6

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE 7

1. No threat 7

Ukraine war proves how weak Russia is. We shouldn’t worry about such a weak “threat” 7

Ukraine proves weakness of Russian military. No way they can threaten the rest of Europe 7

Russia isn’t much of a threat to Europe 7

SOLVENCY - AFF Plan won't improve Europe's military strength because AFF doesn't solve root causes 8

1. No strategic goals 8

Even if Europe gets more capabilities, it won't matter because they have no goals about what they want to use them for 8

Lack of capability isn't the problem: It's lack of strategic judgment. More capability won't change anything 8

Lack of military capability/strategic autonomy makes no difference: That’s not what stopped Europe from responding to multiple recent crises 8

2. No European will to build their defense capabilities 9

Europeans don't know what they're doing and aren't serious about whatever it is 9

DISADVANTAGES 9

1. Reduced global EU influence 9

Link: EU "autonomy" from others makes others independent of them. EU influence decreases the more autonomy they get! 9

Link: More strategic autonomy = less EU global influence on critical global issues 9

Impact: Reduced influence for democracy and rule of law globally - because that's what the EU can do if it has influence 10

Negative: Aircraft Repair

TOPICALITY

1. Nothing reformed

Status Quo is already repairing FMS (Foreign Military Sales) aircraft inside Europe. Example: AAR Component Repair in Amsterdam

AAR Aircraft Component Services company, undated web site accessed 13 Feb 2023. "AAR Aircraft Component Services" https://www.nidv.eu/en/industry-guide/aar-aircraft-component-services/

AAR Component Repair – Amsterdam specializes in maintenance, repair and overhaul of aircraft components for both civil and military markets. AAR Component Repair has built up extensive experience in servicing components for F-16 fighter aircraft for Air Forces in Europe, The United States and other FMS customers. Additional experience is gained on other military aircraft e.g. Chinook, C130 and Apache. In general AAR Component Repair – Amsterdam inspects, repairs overhauls and test pneumatic, hydraulic, electrical, fuel, mechanical components and instruments. F-16 end items serviced by AAR Component Repair include the Jet Fuel Starter, The Acc. Drive Gearbox, The Emergency Power Unit and the Convergent Exhaust Nozzle Control. AAR Component Repair designs and manufactures test stands and provides on-site training on delivery.

Impact: Resolution not affirmed means NEG ballot

If the AFF is affirming Status Quo policy rather than substantial reform, then they can't justify a ballot affirming the resolution. If both sides are endorsing Status Quo policy, it effectively means there are 2 Negative teams in the round, so no matter who wins, you should write "Negative" on the ballot.

INHERENCY

1. The F-16

Poland had the service contract for the F-16 to be performed at Military Aviation Works No. 2 in Poland

*Colonel Tomasz Miedziński 2016. (Retired colonel in the Poland air force; Senior Fellow at the Casimir Pulaski Foundation) 15 Apr 2016 "*Maintenance of F-16 through Foreign Military Sales – a dangerous shortcut" (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://pulaski.pl/en/maintenance-of-f-16-through-foreign-military-sales-a-dangerous-shortcut/

In April 2003 Polish Government signed a contract with the U.S. Government for delivery of 48 multi-role aircraft F-16C / D Block 52+. The agreement was concluded under the Foreign Military Sales, a system of purchasing military equipment from or through the U.S. Government. [**END QUOTE**] In the case of the F-16s, Lockheed Martin Aeronautics form Fort Worth, Texas was the prime contractor. Purchasing in the FMS system of new military equipment that was used in the Polish Armed Forces was the right thing, and was based on the philosophy of Total Package Approach. This allowed for the purchase of not only the aircraft, but also the logistics and training package. Considering the complexity of this weapon system, this approach allowed for fast implementation of the F-16 weapon system to the Polish Armed Forces to an extent which made it possible to start training and operational use (e.g. air policing) at least at a basic level. [**HE CONTINUES LATER IN THE CONTEXT QUOTE**:] In 2013, the Inspectorate of Armaments decided on the contracting of the next package of long-term agreements on maintenance of the Polish F-16s in the FMS system in all areas, including the delivery and repairs of parts (Follow-On Support). Support for the operation of F-16 aircraft in the FMS is a common practice in most countries operating the F-16, and may be a perfect complement to the service contract for the F-16, pursued currently by the Military Aviation Works No. 2 in Bydgoszcz, and securing supplies and repairs performed directly by tactical air bases within their own capabilities. Thus, the contracting of the next package of Follow-On Support agreements itself does not raise any issues in terms of their purpose.

F-16 aircraft are maintained in Romania

Rojoef Manuel 2022 (journalist) 4 Oct 2022 " US, Romania Host F-16 Maintenance and Operations Event for Allies" https://www.thedefensepost.com/2022/10/04/us-romania-f16-event/ (accessed 13 Feb 2023)

The US and five allied nations have [joined](https://www.usafe.af.mil/News/Article-Display/Article/3172841/us-romania-hosts-european-partnership-flight-for-allied-nations/#:~:text=U.S.%2C%20Romania%20hosts%20European%20Partnership%20Flight%20for%20allied%20nations,-Published%20Sept.&text=BASE%2C%20Germany%20%2D%2D-,Service%20members%20from%20the%20U.S.%20military%20and%20the%20allied%20nations,operations%2C%20Sept%2019%2C%202022) a week-long air force partnership event to discuss the maintenance and operations of the F-16 Fighting Falcon in Bucharest, Romania. The US Air Force in Europe-Air Forces Africa and the Romanian Air Force co-hosted the event, which was attended by service members from the US, Belgium, Bulgaria, Poland, Portugal, and Romania. European Partnership Flight was held to bolster the F-16 aviation capacity of the allies with other nations and partners.

2. The F-35

F-35 - Training, ground crews, and logistics are done inside Europe

Vivienne Machi 2022 (journalist) 4 Sept 2022 DEFENSE NEWS "How the F-35 swept Europe, and the competition it could soon face" (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://www.defensenews.com/global/europe/2022/09/04/how-the-f-35-swept-europe-and-the-competition-it-could-soon-face/

But the main selling point for purchasing a European airframe for non-continental allies and partners — the promise of a long strategic relationship — “just doesn’t apply to NATO Europe,” Aboulafia said of the European alliance members. Key benefits include the F-35′s interoperability. The aircraft is used in NATO missions such as Baltic Air Policing, and the U.S. earlier this year deployed several aircraft to the alliance’s eastern borders to support intelligence, surveillance and reconnaissance missions following Russia’s February invasion of Ukraine. As more nations pick the F-35, those countries’ armed services become evermore interoperable across ground crews, training and logistics efforts, said Dan Darling, a senior analyst at Forecast International.

3. Amendola Air Base in Italy

F-35 is maintained at Amendola Air base in Italy by European mechanics

Tom Kington 2022 (journalist) 23 Nov 2022 "Users of the F-35 huddle in Italy to tout joint maintenance plans" DEFENSE NEWS (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://www.defensenews.com/global/europe/2022/11/23/users-of-the-f-35-huddle-in-italy-to-tout-joint-maintenance-plans/

Air force chiefs from around the world who flew into southern Italy this week to discuss getting the best out of their F-35s gathered in front of journalists to watch a mechanic working on an Italian jet. The scene at [Amendola air base](https://www.defensenews.com/global/europe/2022/09/21/joint-but-separate-italy-navy-air-force-settle-on-f-35b-plan/) would have been unremarkable except the mechanic was from the Dutch air force, and was part of a bid to show how F-35 operators can work on each other’s aircraft to save cash, increase efficiencies and show Moscow how united they are.

4. Cameri Air Base in Italy

Italy has new maintenance facility for European F-35s at Cameri Air Base in northern Italy

Tom Kington 2022 (journalist) 23 Nov 2022 "Users of the F-35 huddle in Italy to tout joint maintenance plans" DEFENSE NEWS (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://www.defensenews.com/global/europe/2022/11/23/users-of-the-f-35-huddle-in-italy-to-tout-joint-maintenance-plans/

Italy is also hoping that pooling maintenance will encourage users to send jets to its fledgeling F-35 maintenance hub at Cameri air base in northern Italy, which has hitherto focused on assembling F-35s for European customers.

Cameri is fully certified by US contractor Lockheed Martin for maintenance, repair, overhaul and upgrade

Tom Kington 2022. (journalist) 15 July 2022 " Italy F-35 maintenance hub opens for international customers with Norwegian jet" DEFENSE NEWS (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://www.defensenews.com/global/europe/2022/07/15/italy-f-35-maintenance-hub-opens-for-international-customers-with-norwegian-jet/

Italy’s F-35 final assembly line has been qualified to start offering maintenance to European jets and this month received its first customer: a Norwegian F-35. The Norwegian fighter flew in July 4 after the facility at Cameri in northern Italy achieved full operational capability for F-35 overhauls last month, F-35 manufacturer Lockheed Martin said. A spokeswoman for the firm said the DoD joint program office for the fighter certified Cameri’s Maintenance, Repair, Overhaul, and Upgrade (MROU) facility as achieving full operating capability in June. Cameri, an Italian air force base which started life as a final assembly line for Italy’s expected order of 90 jets and delivered the first in 2015, is owned by the Italian government and operated by Italian state-controlled defense firm Leonardo in partnership with Lockheed Martin.

Maintenance services for F-35 are growing at Cameri Air Base in Italy with Italian mechanics

Tom Kington 2022 (journalist) 23 Nov 2022 "Users of the F-35 huddle in Italy to tout joint maintenance plans" DEFENSE NEWS (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://www.defensenews.com/global/europe/2022/11/23/users-of-the-f-35-huddle-in-italy-to-tout-joint-maintenance-plans/

Italy has rolled 16 F-35A’s and five B’s off the line so far, while the Dutch – after getting their first nine jets assembled in the United States – have had the remainder of its 32 deliveries to date assembled at Cameri, and will receive another 14 from the line by 2024. Dutch air force chief Lt. Gen. Dennis Luyt said he would be using Cameri for maintenance services in the future after rating the assembly work at the base. “We always said if our Italian friends can build a Ferrari they can probably build an F-35 and we have been really impressed by Cameri,” he said. “We are very happy with the aircraft we are receiving. It is important we have places in Europe where we can not only build but also maintain them,” he added.

5. Netherlands parts warehouse

US Defense Dept. (the Pentagon) approved storage of F-35 parts in the Netherlands

Jurgen Donders, article is undated; copyrighted in 2023, references events in 2019. (Partner with GORDIAN logistics company) The Netherlands play a pivotal role in Europe for F-35 logistics (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://gordian.nl/en/nieuwsitem/the-netherlands-play-a-pivotal-role-in-europe-for-f-35-logistics/

The maintenance of the F-35 is being handled in a smart way. The parts that are intended for maintenance in the European region go to the central warehouse in Europe, at the Logistiek Centrum Woensdrecht (LCW) of the Royal Netherlands Air Force. From there, they can be quickly packed and shipped, including customs clearance and export permits. With the approach proposed by the Netherlands, logistics costs are kept low, stocks optimized and good availability of F-35 aircraft must be achieved. Because of this integrated and optimization-oriented approach, the Pentagon chose the Dutch proposal.

6. Great Britain has it too

Royal Air Force base (RAF) Marham and MOD (Ministry of Defense installation) Sealand in Great Britain are doing complete support for F-35s

BAE Systems, article is undated but was written after 2018 and before 2021 based on date references in the context (British defense contractor) "United Kingdom - F-35 Sustainment" (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://www.baesystems.com/en-us/f-35-sustainment-united-kingdom

Home to the UK’s Lightning Force, RAF Marham is  made up of a whole force team working across a number of support functions, including training, logistics, maintenance and engineering all to support F-35B; the Royal Navy and Royal Air Force’s fifth generation multi-role stealth fighter. Our team play a leading role in Lightning Team UK, the industry support team to the F-35 fleet, which is a unique collaboration between Lockheed Martin, BAE Systems, Pratt & Whitney and Rolls-Royce.  
**END QUOTE. THEY GO ON LATER IN THE CONTEXT WRITING QUOTE:**  
At MOD Sealand, we are also part of a team that will provide crucial maintenance, repair, overhaul and upgrade services for F-35 avionic, electronic and electrical systems for hundreds of F-35 aircraft in the UK, Europe and across the globe.

7. Europe military readiness. F-35 solves

F-35 is rolling out across Europe

Peter Suciu 2022 (journalist) 1 Mar 2022 " F-35s Patrol European Skies: Is the Stealth Fighter the Best Deterrent to Russia?" (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://news.clearancejobs.com/2022/03/01/f-35s-patrol-european-skies-is-the-stealth-fighter-the-best-deterrent-to-russia/

American F-35s are currently serving as a deterrent to Russia’s invasion of Ukraine. And the fifth-generation stealth fighter is now being employed by several NATO partners, and even traditionally neutral nations in Europe. It was reported in January that [aerospace](https://www.clearancejobs.com/jobs/aerospace-and-aviation) giant [Lockheed Martin](https://www.clearancejobs.com/jobs/lockheed-martin) had surpassed its 2021 production goal for the F-35, which followed the news that the governments of Switzerland and Finland each chose the highly capable combat aircraft for their respective fighter jet fleets. In December, Helsinki gave the green light to order 64 F-35s with weapon systems in a deal worth $9.4 billion dollars. Switzerland has also moved forward with its plan to acquire an unspecified number of the combat fighters. Other NATO partners are now starting to employ the F-35 as well. Denmark received its first F-35 last year while the Royal Netherlands Air Force (RNAF) had become the eighth nation to declare its fleet of F-35s ready for initial operational capability (IOC).

F-35 solves for European security

Peter Suciu 2022 (journalist) 1 Mar 2022 " F-35s Patrol European Skies: Is the Stealth Fighter the Best Deterrent to Russia?" (accessed 13 Feb 2023) https://news.clearancejobs.com/2022/03/01/f-35s-patrol-european-skies-is-the-stealth-fighter-the-best-deterrent-to-russia/

“The F-35 joint enterprise team continues to provide unmatched combat capability to the 21st-century battlespace through the F-35,” said Bridget Lauderdale, vice-president, and general manager of the F-35 program, via a statement in January. “Providing unparalleled support to the growing fleet, participating in numerous joint-all domain exercises and meeting our delivery target during a global pandemic is no small feat, while the F-35 was also chosen by Switzerland and Finland as their next fighter.” According to standard industry-accepted economic forecasting, the F-35 is also currently responsible for more than 254,000+ direct and indirect U.S. jobs. Yet, what may be most notable is that the highly capable aircraft will hopefully detour Putin from making any rash decisions even as he has much of Eastern Europe in his crosshairs.

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE

1. No threat

Ukraine war proves how weak Russia is. We shouldn’t worry about such a weak “threat”

Prof. Anatol Lieven 2022 (Professor at Georgetown University School of Foreign Service, Qatar, visiting professor in the War Studies Dept of King’s College London, senior fellow of the New America Foundation ) 14 July 2022 “Just How Much Bigger Is the US-NATO Military Force Than Russia's?” <https://www.commondreams.org/views/2022/07/14/just-how-much-bigger-us-nato-military-force-russias> (accessed 26 July 2022)

The Russian invasion of Ukraine, and the atrocities that have accompanied it, have naturally caused deep anxiety throughout Europe. NATO's new Strategic Concept for the next decade calls Russia "the most significant and direct threat to Allies' security and to peace and stability in the Euro-Atlantic area." But before devoting huge additional resources to confront Russia, it would be a good idea to take a level-headed look at Russian military resources and the nature and extent of the Russian military threat to NATO. We should not forget how, after the USSR's collapse, Western intelligence agencies concluded that their Cold War estimates of Soviet military power were greatly[exaggerated](https://www.csmonitor.com/1995/1024/24191.html) (just as, it's worth noting, were Western[predictions](https://www.rferl.org/a/russia-ukraine-invasion-scenarios/31614428.html) of an easy Russian[victory](https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/research_reports/RR2500/RR2563/RAND_RR2563.pdf) over Ukraine this year).

Ukraine proves weakness of Russian military. No way they can threaten the rest of Europe

Doug Bandow 2022 (JD; senior fellow at the Cato Institute; former special assistant to Pres. Reagan) 28 Mar 2022 “With Russia’s Weakness on Full Display: Hawks Now Want America to Fight Russia and China” <https://www.cato.org/commentary/russias-weakness-full-display-hawks-now-want-america-fight-russia-china> (accessed 29 July 2022)

Putin also inadvertently showcased the limits of the Russian armed services. They have significant firepower but suffer from important weaknesses. While raw numbers of troops and tanks would suggest that Moscow could defeat any European nation, poor logistics, maintenance, morale, and training make Russia look substantially less threatening. No doubt, Moscow will learn from its mistakes and address its military’s shortcomings, though it might be short of money to refurbish its force. Nor should Russians be underestimated if defending their country from attack. However, looking ever less plausible are scare stories of a revived Red Army driving across Europe to the Atlantic.

Russia isn’t much of a threat to Europe

Doug Bandow 2022 (JD; senior fellow at the Cato Institute; former special assistant to Pres. Reagan) 28 Mar 2022 “With Russia’s Weakness on Full Display: Hawks Now Want America to Fight Russia and China” <https://www.cato.org/commentary/russias-weakness-full-display-hawks-now-want-america-fight-russia-china> (accessed 29 July 2022)

After World War II, many democratic and friendly states were vulnerable to Soviet subversion and assault. Hence Washington’s policy of containment. Thankfully, the justification for this policy disappeared: the USSR collapsed, the Warsaw Pact dissolved, Eastern European nations raced westward. Had Washington and its allies behaved differently, not treating Moscow as a defeated nation through NATO expansion and more, Russia likely would not have reemerged as a threat. But Putin has helpfully demonstrated that Moscow, though certainly not a paper tiger, nevertheless is not equipped for continent‐​wide aggression.

SOLVENCY - AFF Plan won't improve Europe's military strength because AFF doesn't solve root causes

1. No strategic goals

Even if Europe gets more capabilities, it won't matter because they have no goals about what they want to use them for

Richard Youngs 2021 (senior fellow in the Democracy, Conflict, and Governance Program, based at Carnegie Endowment for Peace / Europe) 8 Mar 2021 "The EU’s Strategic Autonomy Trap" (accessed 5 July 2022) https://carnegieeurope.eu/2021/03/08/eu-s-strategic-autonomy-trap-pub-83955

In this sense, the plea for strategic autonomy rests on a faulty core diagnosis. Most frequently, the geostrategic concern arises not from the EU lacking the capacity to act but from the way that the union chooses to use the capacities it does possess. Listing a standard menu of policy areas and saying the EU needs more capacity in each of them does not provide a geopolitical vision that corrects this shortcoming. Such an approach understands power in a narrow, mechanical fashion, in terms of hardware-type quantitative indicators. This overlooks the kinds of interwoven global relationships and substantive identities that are needed to give these capabilities effective leverage. In this focus, it often appears as if the EU seeks to give itself state-like capacities to affirm its own evolving status, rather than assessing what kinds of influence really work. This echoes a long-noted distortion that EU policies are more about the union’s institutional status than about the de facto means to attain external results.

Lack of capability isn't the problem: It's lack of strategic judgment. More capability won't change anything

Richard Youngs 2021 (senior fellow in the Democracy, Conflict, and Governance Program, based at Carnegie Endowment for Peace / Europe) 8 Mar 2021 "The EU’s Strategic Autonomy Trap" (accessed 5 July 2022) https://carnegieeurope.eu/2021/03/08/eu-s-strategic-autonomy-trap-pub-83955

If one axis of autonomy amounts to a search for more EU defense and technological capabilities, it is not a new or controversial aim. But neither does this amount to a comprehensive vision for strategic leverage. Effective influence concerns the ways in which capacities to act are deployed—through what means, within what kinds of global relations, and to what ends. In most instances, it is not an absence of capabilities that has held the EU back from acting autonomously in recent years. Rather, it is political choice—strategic judgments, whether good or bad, more than insuperable capacity constraints. Simply adding a modest layer of capabilities through more joint European projects will not, in itself, change that underlying reality.

Lack of military capability/strategic autonomy makes no difference: That’s not what stopped Europe from responding to multiple recent crises

Richard Youngs 2021 (senior fellow in the Democracy, Conflict, and Governance Program, based at Carnegie Endowment for Peace / Europe) 8 Mar 2021 "The EU’s Strategic Autonomy Trap" (accessed 5 July 2022) https://carnegieeurope.eu/2021/03/08/eu-s-strategic-autonomy-trap-pub-83955

It is unlikely that such additions would have led the EU to prevent Russia from annexing part of Ukraine in 2014 or engage successfully to defeat the regime of Syrian President Bashar al-Assad. It was not for want of a capacity to act that in the last decade the EU declined to fully support the Arab Spring uprisings, equivocated on Palestinian self-determination, twisted border control into its leading security doctrine, stepped back from further EU enlargement, narrowed the scope of its climate-security policies, and hitched its fortunes to discredited elites across the developing world. In this sense, the plea for strategic autonomy rests on a faulty core diagnosis. Most frequently, the geostrategic concern arises not from the EU lacking the capacity to act but from the way that the union chooses to use the capacities it does possess.

2. No European will to build their defense capabilities

Europeans don't know what they're doing and aren't serious about whatever it is

Sophia Besch 2021 (Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for European Reform’s (CER) Berlin office and a Nonresident Senior Fellow at the Atlantic Council Europe Center. Master’s degrees from the London School of Economics and Sciences Po Paris and is currently pursuing a PhD at King’s College London) 22 Dec 2021 " Rebooting the U.S.-EU Defense Relationship" <https://www.aicgs.org/publication/rebooting-the-u-s-eu-defense-relationship/> (accessed 2 July 2022)

Despite good intentions, however, almost one year into the Biden administration, both sides are frustrated with the lack of progress. Ironically, the diplomatic spat over the AUKUS deal in the fall of 2021 has helped to focus Washington’s attention on European defense. But U.S. defense officials complain that EU member-state representatives tend to present contradicting viewpoints on where EU defense is going, often going so far as to actively undermine each other. They report that when EU officials have come to Washington, they have not been able to discuss many concrete proposals or initiatives on defense and instead deferred to the ‘Strategic Compass’—a sort of defense white book which is expected to yield answers on the direction of EU defense in 2022. Many in the DC defense community worry that the Strategic Compass will turn out to have been nothing but a bureaucratic exercise. They are disheartened by the fact that the funding for the EU’s flagship defense initiatives, the European Defense Fund and the PESCO military mobility project, came in below what was expected, and they wonder whether Europeans themselves are serious about empowering the EU as a defense actor.

DISADVANTAGES

1. Reduced global EU influence

Link: EU "autonomy" from others makes others independent of them. EU influence decreases the more autonomy they get!

Richard Youngs 2021 (senior fellow in the Democracy, Conflict, and Governance Program, based at Carnegie Endowment for Peace / Europe) 8 Mar 2021 "The EU’s Strategic Autonomy Trap" (accessed 5 July 2022) https://carnegieeurope.eu/2021/03/08/eu-s-strategic-autonomy-trap-pub-83955

This element of autonomy entails a particular kind of power. It is power understood as insulation from exogenous impacts—that is, decreasing Europe’s vulnerability to the power and decisions of others. The catch here is that the EU’s autonomy from others will, almost by definition, give others more autonomy from the EU. The flip side of the EU’s multiple moves toward autonomy is that other powers will have less need to cooperate with the union in their own political-strategic actions. In this way, the EU’s quest for strategic autonomy could risk undercutting, not driving, the projection of geopolitical power as well as its support for liberal-democratic values.

Link: More strategic autonomy = less EU global influence on critical global issues

Richard Youngs 2021 (senior fellow in the Democracy, Conflict, and Governance Program, based at Carnegie Endowment for Peace / Europe) 8 Mar 2021 "The EU’s Strategic Autonomy Trap" (accessed 5 July 2022) https://carnegieeurope.eu/2021/03/08/eu-s-strategic-autonomy-trap-pub-83955

Autonomy might be what governments and populations legitimately decide they prefer. But EU leaders need to acknowledge the trade-offs it involves. Pursued as the dominant organizing principle for EU external action, strategic autonomy will likely attenuate the union’s leverage over political instability, democratic transitions, climate policies, violence, and terrorism in other states. Such an approach will give other powers more scope to resist EU pressure and engagement.

Impact: Reduced influence for democracy and rule of law globally - because that's what the EU can do if it has influence

Andres Ortega 2018 (Senior Researh Fellow at the Elcano Royal Institute; M.Sc. (Econ) in International Relations at the London School of Economics) 9 Jan 2018 " The EU’s global normative influence" (accessed 5 July 2022) https://www.realinstitutoelcano.org/en/the-eus-global-normative-influence/

In the context of globalisation, its judicial and institutional framework and the size of its internal market, the EU has a normative capability with effects that go far beyond its borders.[**END QUOTE**] As far back as 2002, drawing inspiration from Johan Galtung’s idea of ‘ideological power’ (1973), Ian Manners introduced the concept of **‘Normative Power Europe’**, which he defined as the ‘ability to shape the conceptions of normal in international relations’. [**HE CONTINUES LATER SAYING QUOTE**:] This means that the EU has emerged as an ‘ideational’ actor, with common principles, which acts to extend norms in international relations. It was originally a political concept –involving democracy, the rule of law and international law– both inward and outward-facing, which with globalisation is proving to have a markedly economic dimension. And this fundamentally emanates from the Court of Justice, from the services provided by the European Commissioner for Competition –with her ability to coerce using monetary sanctions– and from the European Parliament as the legislative power.