Negative Brief: Selective Service

By “Coach Vance” Trefethen

***Resolved: The United States federal government should considerably decrease its military commitments.***

Plan abolishes the Selective Service (draft registration for young men).

Negative: Selective Service 2

TOPICALITY 2

1. Selective Service organization isn’t military 2

Violation: Selective Service isn’t even part of the Defense Department 2

Impact: Negative ballot 2

2. Men registering are not (yet) in the military 2

Registering isn’t enlistment. You’re not in the military just because you register. Example: Might not be fit for service 2

Registering isn’t enlistment: Selective Service hasn’t enlisted anyone since it was reinstated in 1981 2

Impact: Negative ballot 3

3. Not “substantial” decrease 3

Link: Selective Service budget is $23 million with 100 employees 3

If we compared it to the Defense Dept. budget (which it isn’t part of) it would be $23 million divided by $738 billion. So AFF saves 0.003% WOW! 3

Impact: Negative ballot 3

DISADVANTAGES 4

BIG LINKS TO US HEGEMONY / NATIONAL SECURITY 4

Selective Service system is a very inexpensive insurance policy to maintain US national security 4

2020 two and a half year study finds: Selective Service essential to national security 4

2.5 year independent study commissioned by Congress considered all the alternatives and concluded Selective Service should be maintained to uphold US national security 4

BRING IN ALL THE DISADVANTAGES FROM THE NEGATIVE “US HEGEMONY” DISAD BRIEF 4

Negative: Selective Service

TOPICALITY

1. Selective Service organization isn’t military

Violation: Selective Service isn’t even part of the Defense Department

US Selective Service official website 2020. (article is undated but contains references to material dated in 2020 or later, like the budget for fiscal year ending Sept 30, 2021) <https://www.sss.gov/about/> (accessed 26 May 2021)

The Selective Service System is an independent agency within the Executive Branch of the U.S. Federal Government. The Director of Selective Service is appointed by the President of the United States. Selective Service is not part of the Department of Defense.

Impact: Negative ballot

No one is affirming the resolution in this debate, so no matter who wins you should vote Negative.

2. Men registering are not (yet) in the military

Registering isn’t enlistment. You’re not in the military just because you register. Example: Might not be fit for service

Text of the Military Selective Service Act As Amended through Public Law 112-166, August 10, 2012 (accessed 26 May 2021) https://www.sss.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/Military-Selective-Service-Act.pdf



Registering isn’t enlistment: Selective Service hasn’t enlisted anyone since it was reinstated in 1981

John Ismay 2015 (journalist) Unused Since 1973, Military Draft Infrastructure Remains Ready 30 Oct 2015 <https://americanhomefront.wunc.org/2015-10-30/unused-since-1973-military-draft-infrastructure-remains-ready> (accessed 26 May 2021)

First off, the obvious. The last American was drafted in 1973. President Jimmy Carter brought the Selective Service system out of deep freeze in 1981, after the U.S.S.R. invaded Afghanistan, once again requiring "male persons" to register on their eighteenth birthdays. They must remain registered until they turn 26. If they don't they could lose federal education benefits and be disqualified for federal jobs.  But it would basically take a Martian invasion, as Julie Lynn, California Director of the Selective Service joked, to actually reinstate the draft.

Impact: Negative ballot

No one is affirming the resolution in this debate, so no matter who wins you should vote Negative.

3. Not “substantial” decrease

Link: Selective Service budget is $23 million with 100 employees

John Ismay 2015 (journalist) Unused Since 1973, Military Draft Infrastructure Remains Ready 30 Oct 2015 <https://americanhomefront.wunc.org/2015-10-30/unused-since-1973-military-draft-infrastructure-remains-ready> (accessed 26 May 2021)

"I mean after September 11, all of the armed forces got more volunteers than they could handle," Lynn said. "They turned away volunteers because they were getting more people than they could use." Nevertheless, the Selective Service continues to be funded at about $23 million a year and has about 100 employees nationwide.

If we compared it to the Defense Dept. budget (which it isn’t part of) it would be $23 million divided by $738 billion. So AFF saves 0.003% WOW!

Lawrence J. Korb 2020 (senior fellow at the Center for American Progress. Former assistant secretary of defense in the Reagan administration; served four years on active duty as a naval flight officer; and retired from the U.S. Navy Reserve with the rank of captain ) 6 May 2020 " The Pentagon’s Fiscal Year 2021 Budget More Than Meets U.S. National Security Needs" https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/security/reports/2020/05/06/484620/pentagons-fiscal-year-2021-budget-meets-u-s-national-security-needs/#:~:text=The%20FY%202021%20defense%20budget%20is%20composed%20of%20two%20parts,%2473%20billion%20in%20FY%202020.

When the Trump administration unveiled its FY 2021 federal budget, many defense hawks in and out of government expressed concerns that the increase in the size of the proposed $740 billion defense budget was too modest, particularly when compared with the $738 billion that the U.S. Department of Defense (DOD) received for FY 2020.

Impact: Negative ballot

Affirmative had a duty to affirm a considerable reduction and they failed. We’re wasting 2 hours debating a 0.003% reduction. It would be even less if we compared it to the entire Federal budget.

DISADVANTAGES

BIG LINKS TO US HEGEMONY / NATIONAL SECURITY

Selective Service system is a very inexpensive insurance policy to maintain US national security

John Ismay 2015 (journalist) Unused Since 1973, Military Draft Infrastructure Remains Ready 30 Oct 2015 <https://americanhomefront.wunc.org/2015-10-30/unused-since-1973-military-draft-infrastructure-remains-ready> (accessed 26 May 2021)

"We're a very inexpensive insurance policy," said Selective Service Director Larry Romo.  "It's just like Heaven forbid, we don't want to use nuclear weapons, but we have nuclear weapons."

2020 two and a half year study finds: Selective Service essential to national security

Selective Service System 2020. National Commission Multi-Year Study Affirms the Nation Needs to Maintain the Selective Service 25 March 2020 <https://www.sss.gov/news/national-commission-final-report/#:~:text=The%20Commission%20stated%20that%20%E2%80%9Cthe,a%20symbol%20of%20U.S.%20national> (accessed 26 May 2021)

On the morning of Wednesday, March 25, 2020, the National Commission on Military, National and Public Service released its [final report](https://inspire2serve.gov/reports).  The 255-page document containing 49 recommendations recapped the Commission’s efforts from the past two and a half-year analysis studying the Selective Service, registration, and methods of generating greater interest in military, national and public service.  The Commission stated that “the nation needs the Selective Service System (SSS) to remain a viable U.S. national security institution.”  The report further asserts that the Selective Service serves as a hedge against military personnel shortages during a national security emergency and is a symbol of U.S. national resolve. “We congratulate the National Commission on the successful completion of their report and are pleased to have their endorsement,” said U.S. Selective Service [Director Donald M. Benton.](https://www.sss.gov/news/donald-m-benton-appointed-director-of-the-u-s-selective-service-system/) “Their thorough, multi-year study reaffirms the necessity for a strong Selective Service System.” The Commission affirmed that registration remains a civic duty and should continue. It also recommended that registration be expanded to include women.

2.5 year independent study commissioned by Congress considered all the alternatives and concluded Selective Service should be maintained to uphold US national security

National Commission on Military, National, and Public Service 2020. (bipartisan committee – not part of the Selective Service – created by Congress to study the Selective Service system; conducted a 2.5 year study) Inspired to Serve - The Final Report of the National Commission on Military, National, and Public Service March 2020 <https://inspire2serve.gov/reports/final-report> (accessed 26 May 2021)

After careful consideration of the alternatives, the Commission recommends maintaining the Selective Service System as a draft contingency mechanism. In addition, the Commission offers recommendations to modernize, enhance, and improve the fairness of the system for mobilizing the Nation for military service as well as recommendations designed to take advantage of volunteers who may step forward in a national emergency before the Nation turns to the draft. Ensuring successful and timely national mobilization in the event of a national emergency requires advance planning, maintenance of a draft contingency mechanism, and improved transparency and confidence in the process by which the Nation would mobilize.

BRING IN ALL THE DISADVANTAGES FROM THE NEGATIVE “US HEGEMONY” DISAD BRIEF